A comparison of Eastern Free State IDPs: Where are the gaps?

Paper presented by Geoffrey Mukwada at the Knowledge And Development – Strategic Workshop of the Research Cluster on Sustainable Development and Poverty Alleviation -
Held 2 September 2011

Definition of Integrated Development Plan (IDP)

- "The IDP is essentially a planning methodology that links a statement of purpose with plans, programmes, institutional design and practice, monitoring mechanisms and financial flows" (Pieterse, 2002).

- A key instrument in an evolving framework of intergovernmental planning and coordination (Harrison, 2006)

The Municipal Systems Act of 2000 specifies the minimum contents of the IDP as:

- ❑ A vision for the long-term development of the municipality

- ❑ An assessment of the current level of servicing and of economic and social development in municipality

- ❑ The municipal councils' development priorities and objectives for its elected term

- ❑ The local council's development strategies (which must be aligned with any national or provincial plans) and operational strategies

- ❑ A Spatial Development Framework (which must include guidelines for a land use management system)

Objectives of the comparison

- Undertake Content Analysis of three Municipal IDPs to determine:

1. The extent to which the IDPs comply with the requirements of the Municipal Systems Act (Act 32) of 2000 and the Local Government Integrated Planning Guide

2. The gaps in the IDPs

3. What data the municipalities are currently using for planning purposes and whether the data can be used for integrated planning at the regional level

Spatial variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Spatio-functional classification	√	√	0
Location	0	0	0
Altitude	0	0	0
Distances between towns	√	√	0
Location of roads and railways	0	0	0
Size (sq km)	0	0	0
Aerial map	√	0	0
Settlement pattern	0	0	0
Development zones in terms of Spatial Development Framework	0	√	0
Ward structure	√ – (IDP project list for wards)	0	√
Spatial Development Frameworks	0 - (framework mentioned but not presented anywhere)	√	√

Population Data:
Birth place, citizenship, languages and disability

Social variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Birth place	0	0	0
Citizenship	0	0	0
Languages	0	0	0
Disabled	√ (but number of disabled people in different places not mentioned)	√ (number with different types of disability given)	0

Demographic Data

Demographic variables		Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Total population		√	√	√
	Total population per town/municipality	√	N/A	N/A
	Percentage of population per town/ward/municipality	√	0	0
Population density (p/sqkm)		√	0	0
	Per municipality	√	0	0
Gender distribution				
	Males/females (per town/ward/area)	0	0	0
	Per ethnic groups (per town/ward/area)	0	√ (actual numbers stated)	0
Age distribution (groups)				
	By gender	0	0	0
	By area	0	0	0
Registered voters		0	0	0

Educational Data

Educational variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Education levels (highest level reached)	0	√	0
Percentage without primary schooling	0	√ (actual number)	0
Percentage with secondary/tertiary schooling	0	√ (actual numbers)	0
Changes in education levels	0	0	0
Enrolled students	0	0	0
School attendance (by type)	0	0	0
Illiteracy	0	0	0

Population Growth

Growth rate variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Population growth rate	√	0	0
Average annual % population growth	√	0	0
Population growth per gender	0	0	0
Historical growth rates	√ (2001-2006)	0	0
Projected growth rates	√ (2006-2011)	0	0
Future population according to estimated growth rates	0	0	0
Population growth by ethnic groups	0	0	0
Population growth by towns/municipalities	0	0	0
Annual deaths per town (%)	0	0	0

Migration

Migration variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Trends	√	0	0
Projected net migration	0	0	0
Annual net migration (by ethnic group)	0	0	0
Percentage of population never moved	0	0	0
Household migration	0	0	0
Country/province/area of origin	0	0	0

Income – Municipal Level

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Annual per capita income (by town)	0	0	0
individual monthly income	0	√	0
Average income per person/day	0	0	0
Income levels within communities	0	0	0

Income – Household Level

Income variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Monthly household income	0	√	0
by income levels	0	√	0
Mean household income	0	0	0
Percentage of households with less than R800 per month	0	√ (401-800)	0
Percentage of households with less than R600 per month	0	0	0
Households dependent on social assistance	0	0	0
Households dependent on state subsidies	0	0	0
Households below MLL	0	0	0
Percentage of households below household subsistence level	0	0	0
No of indigent households registered	0	0	0
Percentage of households without income	0	√	0
main income sources	0	0	0

Socioeconomic Conditions

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
No of households total	0	√	√
Average household size	0	0	0
Female headed households	0	0	0
Child headed households	0	0	0
Percentage of households headed by a person without formal education	0	0	0

Housing

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Total no of dwellings	0	√	√
Percentage of formal housing	0	√- (actual number stated)	0
No of informal dwellings	0	√	0
No of backyard dwellings	0	0	0
Percentage of backyard dwellings	0	0	0
No of traditional dwellings	0	0	0
No of other type of dwelling	0	√	0
Percentage of dwellings not in backyard	0	0	0
Housing types	0	√	0
Housing pattern (% formal vs informal, per ward)	0	√	0
No of rooms per household	0	0	0
Private investments	0	0	0
Increase/decrease	0	0	0

Bulk Infrastructure

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Number of stands	√	0	√
Average water demand/peak	√	0	0
Treatment capacity ml/day	√	0	0
Reservoir storage ml	√	0	0
Reserve Days	√	0	0
Average Sewerage flow ml/day	√	0	0
Treatment capacity ml/day	√	0	0
Reserve capacity ml	√	0	0

Medical Facilities

Specifications	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Medical facilities	0	√	0
distribution/location	0	√	0
total no	0	√	0
no of hospitals	0	√	0
no of clinics	0	√	0
no of mobile clinics	0	√	0
no of CHCs	0	√	0
staff no	0	0	0

Environmental Information

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Major problems/development constraints	√	√	0
Development potentials/opportunities	√	0	0
Identification of sensitive areas	√	0	0
Map of protected areas	0	0	0
Biosphere reserves	0	0	0
Land use pattern	0	0	0
Map of irrigated land & dams	0	0	0
Considerations for water resource management	√	0	0
Cultural and historical sites	√	0	0
Heritage sites	√	0	0
Aesthetic resources	√	0	0
Natural resources	√	√	0
Regional Geology	√	0	0
Minerals	0	√	0
Mining activities	√	√	0
Landforms/cover	√	0	0

Climate

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Climate classification (arid, sub-arid, etc.)	√	0	0
Rainfall	√	0	0
Average daily temperatures	0	0	0
Map with mean annual rainfall	0	0	0

Environmental damage & hazards

Variables (Env.damage)	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Pollution	√	√	0
Air quality	√	√	0
Water quality	√	√	0

Variables (Hazards)			
Hazards	√	√	0
Flood lines	√	√	0
Sedimentation	√ -(but rates not given)	√- (but no rates given)	0
Erosion	√- (but rates not given)	√ - (but rates not given)	0
Slopes (average)	0	0	0
Rainfall reported during flooding period	0	0	0

Ecology & Biodiversity

Variables (Ecology)	Specification	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Ecological classification (ecosystem/biome)		0	0	0
Soil conditions		√	0	0
	water holding capacity	0	0	0

Variable (Biodiversity)	Specification			
Vegetation & biodiversity		0	√	0
	alien vegetation	0	0	0
	threatened and unusual species	0	0	0
	carrying capacity	0	0	0

Hydrology

Variables	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung
Drainage	0	0	0
Ground water	0	0	0
Surface water	√	√	0
Dams	√	√	0
Wetlands and springs	√	√	0

Level of conformance

Variable Categories	Number of variables and/or specifications (V)	Number of conformances (C)	Number of possible conformances (VxN)	% Level of conformance [C/(VxN)] x100
Spatial	11	10	33	30.3
Population (birth place, citizenship, languages and disability)	4	0	12	0
Population growth	9	4	27	14.8
Demographic	11	8	33	24.2
Education	7	3	21	14.3
Migration	6	1	18	5.6
Income (municipal level)	4	1	12	8.3
Income (household level)	12	4	36	11.1
Socioeconomic	5	2	15	13.3

Number of municipalities (N)=3

Variable Categories	Number of variables and/or specifications (V)	Number of conformances (C)	Number of possible conformances (VxN)	% Level of conformance [C/(VxN)] x100
Housing	13	10	39	25.6
Bulk infrastructure	8	12	24	50.0
Medical	8	7	24	29.2
Environmental (state)	16	18	48	37.5
Environmental damage	3	7	9	77.8
Environmental hazards	6	8	18	44.4
Climate	4	5	12	41.7
Ecology	3	2	9	22.2
Biodiversity	4	1	12	8.3
Hydrology	5	6	15	40.0
Total	139	109	417	N/A

Number of municipalities (N)=3

Average level of conformance = 26.1%
Number of municipalities (N) = 3

Conformances	Thabo Mofutsanyana	Dihlabeng	Maluti a Phofung	Total
Number conformances	51	51	7	109
% Level of conformance per municipality	36.7	36.7	5.0	26.1

What the results of the analysis show

- There is a mismatch between the IDPs and Local Government Integrated Planning Practical Guide and the requirements of the Municipal Systems Act (Act 32) of 2000

- All three IDPs exhibit gaps (inadequacies), indicating the possibility that the concerned municipalities lack the capacity to design IDPs

- There is no evidence of collaboration between municipalities regarding the drawing of IDPs, which are fashioned according to political jurisdictions

Conclusion: Implications and reflections

- Due to lack of collaboration between municipalities there is no unified approach to IDPs since the nature of variables (specifications) used and the data collected about them vary enormously from one municipality to another

- The need to undertake integrated planning at regional level is necessitated by the reality that Human-Environment systems are coupled, dynamic, co-adapting and shaped by the geography of an area and much less by political decisions alone.

- Without collaboration and a unified approach to planning, can regional integration and sustainability be achieved?

THANK YOU!!!

Without collaboration and a unified approach to planning, can regional integration and sustainability be achieved?